

# revista de **e**DUCCIÓN

Nº 375 ENERO-MARZO 2017



**Patrimonios en conflicto, competencias cívicas y formación profesional en educación primaria I**

**Conflictive heritages, civic competence and professional training in primary education**

Andrés Domínguez Almansa  
Ramón López Facal



# Conflictive heritages, civic competence and professional training in primary education<sup>1</sup>

## Patrimonios en conflicto, competencias cívicas y formación profesional en educación primaria

DOI: 10.4438/1988-592X-RE-2016-375-336

Andrés Domínguez Almansa

Ramón López Facal

*Universidad de Santiago de Compostela*

### Abstract

This paper presents the results of a study on the development of the professional competence of students training to become primary education teachers. This study is based on incorporating research on immaterial, invisible or hidden heritage into education. The results are contrasted with those obtained when applying the model in the primary classroom during teaching practice. The objective of the study was to test whether heritage education can become an effective tool in the initial stages of teacher training and in the development of civic behaviour among primary school pupils. Our basis is a concept of heritage which transcends the traditional historical-artistic dimension. We have incorporated research on uncomfortable or conflictive aspects of heritage, such as victims and places relating to the memory of the Spanish Civil War. Our interpretative research followed a qualitative methodology, thereby making the ethnographic method compatible with the case study. Attention was paid both to the process followed in teacher training classes at university and its subsequent application and development in the primary education classroom. Two types of samples were selected for the study, both of which were incidental. The first consisted of a group of 74 teacher training students. In the second, a case study

---

<sup>(1)</sup> Research financed by the Plan Nacional de I+D (EDU2015-65621-C3-1-R).

was carried out analysing the results of two of those students who, during their period of teaching practice, worked in collaboration with two groups of pupils from the 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> years of primary education in a rural area. The trainee teachers employed and developed a teaching and learning model incorporating both the rational and emotional dimensions of heritage in order to construct identities, which they then applied with success in the primary classroom.

*Key words:* Heritage education, primary education, teacher training, conflictive heritage.

### Resumen

Se presentan los resultados de un estudio sobre el desarrollo de competencias profesionales de estudiantes de magisterio. Se ha basado en la incorporación de la investigación sobre una dimensión del patrimonio inmaterial, como invisible u ocultado. Se contrastan los resultados con los obtenidos al aplicar el modelo en aulas de educación primaria durante la etapa de prácticas formativas. La finalidad del estudio ha sido comprobar si la educación patrimonial puede ser un instrumento eficaz para la formación inicial del profesorado y para el desarrollo de competencias cívicas entre el alumnado de primaria. Se parte de una concepción de patrimonio que trasciende la dimensión histórico-artística tradicional. Se ha incorporado la indagación sobre patrimonios incómodos o en conflicto como víctimas y lugares de memoria relacionados con la guerra civil española. La investigación de tipo interpretativo, ha seguido una metodología cualitativa que compatibiliza el método etnográfico con el estudio de caso. Se ha atendido tanto al proceso seguido en las aulas universitarias de formación del profesorado como a su aplicación y desarrollo posterior en aulas de educación primaria. Se han seleccionado dos tipos de muestras, ambas incidentales: un grupo voluntario de 74 estudiantes de magisterio, realizándose un estudio de caso analizando los resultados de dos de esos alumnos que trabajaron colaborativamente durante sus prácticas formativas, con dos grupos de escolares de 4.º y 5.º curso de educación primaria en una localidad rural. Los maestros en formación han asumido y desarrollado un modelo para la enseñanza y aprendizaje que incorpora la dimensión racional y la emocional del patrimonio para la construcción de identidades, aplicándolo con éxito en aulas de primaria.

*Palabras clave:* Educación patrimonial, enseñanza primaria, formación de profesores, patrimonio conflictivo.

## **Introduction**

There is a social representation regarding what heritage is, which is commonly associated to particular natural events or to historical-artistic ensembles of monuments taken out of their context. In the normal course of events, no rational or emotional identification is produced uncritically. Understanding other types of heritage involves opening oneself up to new realities, which may arouse emotions leading to reflection.

A more complex conception of heritage may have educational relevance as it is the product of individual or collective adhesions via a process of identification or the establishment of the feeling of belonging to something (Fontal, 2004, 2011). Education creates a framework for reflection, which leads to conscious and critical processes of identification with heritage. Both material and immaterial elements are necessary to confer an emotional dimension upon some things and to turn them into a heritage resource (Prats & Santacana, 2009a and 2009b). However, they must be integrated into a context, into the landscape of which they form a part. This landscape must, in turn, be understood as a heritage resource, enabling the construction of citizen conscience and social identities (Busquet, 2010; Domínguez & López, 2014 and 2015a) and as a living space (Benayas & López, 2010) in which different elements with the potential to be considered as heritage resources can be worked with. This includes those elements which may be considered uncomfortable or undesirable (Prats, 1997 and 2005). Thus, the landscape may acquire a civic dimension (Council of Europe, 2000).

This research proposes the incorporation of this way of contemplating heritage into the education of trainee teachers in order to assess whether it contributes towards developing and improving their professional competence. The idea is that these skills may be improved by the assumption of a critical and active conscience, implying the recognition of the importance of investigating one's surroundings in order to promote processes to build inclusive social identities, leading to the development of innovative practices related to heritage education. The examination of the results obtained from the trainee teachers during their period of teaching practice enabled us to analyse to what degree they managed to improve their teaching skills.

## Conflictive heritages: victims, places of suffering and memory

Assuming heritage as a relationship between people and resources implies an ethical, not technical, dimension. In order to recognize something as heritage, social legitimization is needed, along with a discourse of identity which is not exempt from ideological disputes (Estepa, Domínguez & Cuenca, 1998; Prats & Hernández, 1999). There are uncomfortable heritages (Prats, 2005) which can become conflictive. One such example is the heritage generated in processes of identification with the victims of the Civil War and the Francoist regime as a symbol of the recuperation of historical memory for an active sector of the population. The education of able teachers must include a critical perspective of the past and the problems of the present (Domínguez & López, 2015b). In this regard, it is appropriate to build knowledge based on the acquisition of social skills, promoting reflection in contexts of investigation and advancing socially and ethically integrating realities which bring conflict to light as a mediator of more socially acceptable consensuses.

Cuesta (2014, 21) proposes a break from the routines of school culture in order to invent more suitable scenarios, be they virtual or physical, making public use of historical knowledge formed in the context of school possible, using the reason for the suffering of the vanquished, and their voices rescued from the past, as a rational and emotional method of analysis. Thus contemplating a history based on memory, incorporating the knowledge of those who fought for a fairer reality and integrating the history of suffering compared to the banalization of the human condition (Cuesta, 2014 y 2015). The victims of the 1936 coup d'état can become part of heritage upon discovering and reflecting upon the everyday landscapes associated with them or the sites dedicated to their memory. Therefore, local sites can play a role in education, obtaining a new meaning due to a form of historical knowledge which enables processes of identification with everyday landscapes and their relocation in collective memory (Domínguez & López 2014 and 2015a). In addition, the use of memory contributes towards developing processes of identification with hidden elements which are worthy of becoming heritage resources in that heritage is nurtured by identity and memory. These resources, whilst still remaining local, will also become localized (Prats, 2005) due to the fact that interest in them reaches beyond the community in which they are situated.

We carried out research based on these hypotheses among undergraduates studying to become primary school teachers (Teacher Training Faculty, University of Santiago de Compostela, Lugo Campus) throughout the 2015-2016 academic year. Our aim was to test the ability of trainee teachers to assume a civic concept of heritage, to formulate proposals in accordance with this concept and, as proof of their progress in the acquisition of professional competence, to communicate this perspective to primary school pupils, thereby demonstrating their ability to transfer educational discourse to real teaching practice.

This general aim was refined into other, more specific, objectives:

- The ability to investigate in the surrounding area and connect research and innovation in professional practice, assuming the need to investigate in order to gain knowledge.
- To develop social skills, to discover scenarios of the political extermination carried out following the 1936 coup in the surrounding area. To approach victims and their invisibility both rationally and emotionally. To consider this as a relevant problem for the primary classroom.
- To question social representations regarding heritage, to evaluate the possibility of contemplating victims and sites associated with them as collectively shared heritage resources.
- To develop the professional competence of teamwork, designing and developing proposals for teaching.
- To apply the experience acquired in the university classroom in the practice of primary education by way of projects promoting processes of identification with heritage resources in the surrounding area.

## **Methodology**

We worked on the assumption that the responsibility of teacher trainers, their attitude and their way of teaching acquire particular importance due to the fact that they become a reference point for their students' subsequent teaching practice. In order to promote a critical teaching model, it is necessary to adopt critical procedures in the early stages of

teacher training (Johnston, 2006), such as resorting to research or investigation in the surrounding area, teaching students to question stereotypes and attracting students to a concept of heritage which incorporates the memory of suffering and its application in everyday landscapes.

This paper is based on the tradition of qualitative research (Flick, 2004) and has taken interpretative research methods (Erikson, 1989) into account. A holistic point of view has been adopted, integrating the ethnographic method (Creswell, 1998; Denzin & Lincoln, 2005; Sandín, 2003) and incorporating case study research (Stake, 1994) for the part concerning the primary classroom. The educational process was focused on the classroom via the description and analysis of the processes.

The research was structured in two phases, each consisting of several sessions. The first phase was carried out from September to December 2015 with an incidental sample of 74 students in the third year of their degree in primary teaching. The second phase, a case study, was based on a follow-up of two of the trainee teachers who had taken part in the first phase and who had expressed an interest in working with social sciences using a critical methodology. We have studied the activities and the results they obtained in their teaching practice in a school in a rural area of the province of Lugo (NW Spain) with pupils from the 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> years of primary education from February to April 2016.

The principal methods of obtaining data generated in the first phase were to ask the students to produce individual and group narratives and to examine their final proposals for activities for primary pupils. The data corresponding to the teaching practice of the two students include recordings made with primary pupils, a notebook completed by the pupils at home, observational diaries and a final report provided by both trainee teachers. The data was then narrowed down in order to reduce and relativize it in an attempt to make it easier to understand and transform it to obtain results (Taylor & Bogdan, 1984; Rodríguez, Gil & García, 1999; García Llamas, 2003). For this process, the decision was taken not to establish categories for analysis prior to the research but, once the production arising from the innovative context had been analysed, to identify common elements leading to the acquisition of skills on the part of the trainee teachers.

## The first phase: initial training

First of all, an activity was used which had already been tested in previous studies (Domínguez & López, 2015b). The students, organized into 17 small groups, went out of the classroom in order to discover what had previously existed on a site now occupied by a modern hotel and if any relevant events had occurred in that place (an old cemetery, executions, a mass grave, remnants of memories and a hidden past). This task was complemented by an urban route in search of both visible and invisible remains perpetuating the memory of the dictatorship in nearby buildings (Figure 1).

Back in the classroom, the students were provided with different sources containing great emotional significance in the reconstruction of a history based on memory, from a local to a global scale: historiographic elements, a documentary, the [www.nomesvoces.net](http://www.nomesvoces.net) database on victims in Galicia, work on oral sources, military trials, death certificates and written reports. These documents, along with the data gathered on the field trips, enabled an initial process of data sharing based on dialogue and shared reflection.

The second phase of the process consisted of analysing the scarcity, or complete lack, of attention paid to these topics in the compulsory education system and debating the appropriateness of including the issue of suffering on both sides, rather than the discourse inherited from the dictatorship, thus putting perpetrators and victims on the same level (Domínguez & Santiago, 2014). It was debated whether being aware of barbarity avoids it being repeated and whether an empathetic and rational form of education, which is committed to human rights, is needed. Following a debate on the difficulties of including this topic in the primary education system, a proposal originating from the coastal village of O Pindo in the province of A Coruña was analysed. The local people of this area are divided among those defending and those opposing a unique granite landscape in the area being designated as a natural park. In this area, the memory of the victims of the national conflict has been rediscovered due to a finding (an engraved name) in a cave used as a refuge for those fleeing persecution in 1936. The perception of this site has, therefore, acquired a new heritage perspective as it now also includes a history based on memory.

In the final phase of the project, following an overview of significant sites in the city of A Coruña and watching documentaries on violent situations in more distant contexts (in Rwanda and among bonobos), the students were asked to work together to design specific proposals for the primary classroom, which were worked on and then presented in groups.

### **The second phase: teaching practice with primary pupils**

Two trainee teachers who carried out their teaching practice in the same rural school continued working on this model of cooperative work. They researched the resources located in the local area and their attention was drawn to a monument located some distance from the school built in remembrance of a group of men and women killed in 1937. They decided to design and carry out an activity which included this memorial, along with other notable elements of the surrounding area (a medieval tower, a sculpture of a deer and a fountain incorporating a group of sculptures).

They began by showing pictures of these sites in class in order to determine whether the children were aware of them, knew where they were, knew their significance and whether they had an appreciation for them. In the second session, the trainee teachers used a small dossier they had produced themselves, supported by a computer presentation, to show: images of the creation of a local agricultural trade union in the first third of the 20<sup>th</sup> century; images of an execution by firing squad; Castela's illustration *A derradeira lección do mestre* and a photo of a teacher from the village, who was killed in 1936 and is remembered in the monument; a montage containing a photograph of hippies and another of prisoners of the Franco regime and another with queues of people escaping from the Civil War and from the current situation in Syria. The pupils were asked to work together in small groups to choose a word to define each scene, which was then debated among the whole class. They were also asked to complement the task individually, at home, by writing down what it represented for them and the emotions which the images provoked.

Then, the children went on a trip around the local area in order to put processes of the history of the area into context, some of them related to the images shown in class, particularly the memorial (Figure 2). Finally, the children's sense of identification with the monuments was assessed,

along with their reasons, whether they would change anything and whether they were interested in the memory of past suffering being present in their area.

### **The data: from the method to commitment (the first phase)**

Some significant data on the evaluation of the experience in the university classroom was selected in order to assess the development of skills. The most relevant elements identified were: the importance of a method based on innovation; the use of documentary sources as a teaching resource to combine rational and emotional aspects; empathy as a means of commitment and critical capacitation. All of this led to reflections and proposals for educational application in accordance with these assessments.

As far as the working methodology is concerned:

Dealing with this topic made us think a lot and created a deep interest (Group B: GB)

...it was a much more illustrative approach for the children than for us. (GE)

...in a different way to how it was presented in our education. (GI)

On working with sources:

...we didn't know anything about this...our teachers just taught from the text book. (GN)

...we agreed on the importance of the oral sources...a better understanding in a more direct way. (GD)

...we were able to appreciate the value of memory and we have been encouraged to ask our elders...it's never too late to understand the social sciences from a critical perspective. (GF)

On empathetic and critical attitudes:

...it's extremely sad to get to university without knowing anything about the victims. (GE)

...We had never considered this fear and all that it has led to in today's society...it made us think and brought out a lot of emotions. (G.B)

...it's really sad that it remains hidden...justified by the political stability of the Transition. (G.H)

...we learnt to see Lugo in a new light...We discovered its hidden memories... which are not nearly as recognized as its glorious Roman past. (GN)

The evaluation of the group named GQ, which contained the students who carried out the second phase of the project in the primary classroom (identified as AC1 and AC2), is quite similar:

[The method]...revolutionary...it was completely constructive via guided discovery.

[The use of sources] None of the resources we are used to using at school are better able to communicate what these people told us through their tears.

[Empathy]...Both the memory of those who suffered directly and indirectly is extremely important.

Anticipated difficulties regarding the inclusion of similar activities in the primary classroom:

Fifty-nine students mentioned opposition among families, for reasons of ideology, protectionism or productivity.

...they think that it is best to follow the textbook in order to finish it by the end of the year (Student-female- 1: AM1)

...they think the children are not old enough...or that teachers are there for other reasons. (AM2)

...maybe they don't agree due to their ideology. (AH1)

Forty-two students expressed the opinion that teachers are controlled by the families and school routines and, to a lesser degree, by ideologies:

...I would not be supported and people would not speak well of me. (AH2)

...maybe they would not agree with my way of thinking. (AH3)

...taking into account the fact that it is a taboo topic, which is going to make families uncomfortable and which may not be appropriate. (AM3).

Eight mentioned the pupils:

...it's a boring, uninteresting topic...it could lead to fear in children with a certain degree of emotional sensibility. (AM4).

All of the students demonstrated a desire for change, a belief that things will change, a will to engage in debate with the community and were convinced of the effectiveness of attractive and fair proposals:

...I hope and believe that society in this country has advanced...our generations will be unafraid of changing the system and introducing these topics. (AH4)

...if the teacher's position is clear on the methods and reasons, it will be extremely easy to defend the application of these methods. (AM5)

...we must speak in terms of victims and murderers...regardless of the side they were on...I don't believe that any teacher...or parent would object. (AM6)

As these reflections were prior to the presentation of a proposed educational model, the majority of the students did not make specific proposals but rather, in some cases, referred to their recent experience:

...a little excursion...or going on a discovery activity. (AM8)

I would ask the children to get to know...to look around them...I would take them to see places...to listen to a talk by the victims. (AM9).

One student expressed the opinion that "the main problem would be me. I refuse to follow the textbook but I would not know what methodology to employ" (AM10). This led to the group deciding that they were part of the problem and that it was necessary to work with a guided proposal. One of the students who went on to employ this method in the period of teaching practice expressed the view that both teachers and parents are a problem, but one which could be solved by using this method, which is enjoyable for children and facilitates communication with families. However, the other expressed it as a problem of society in general and considered that it is necessary "to use the surrounding area and everything which happened there." (AC1).

This phase ended with proposals (17) being made, which were characterised by their diversity and wealth, with prior research covering landscapes and memories (Groups F, O, K, B, D, G, N). This implication was impossible to predict at the beginning of the process: "working from a different perspective...motivates us to investigate more in order to be better able to teach our future pupils." (GC)

Eleven students focused on specific settings: urban streets, places with heritage value which are given new meaning with the knowledge of the victims or places in which barbaric actions are remembered.

...this particular building remained forgotten...but its importance must be highlighted as it was a hiding place for those fleeing persecution. (GD)  
...relating the caves with the people that hid there...if the guide is not aware of this, the pupil can propose it as a topic for discussion. (GN)

The renunciation of expositive methods is frequent, especially regarding textbooks: "...made by a powerful publisher that probably got that power thanks to how the war ended" (GC). The students fostered participation, investigation and emotional experimentation: "We will forbid you to play in the break time...because I say so... (but) we are not going to forbid...we will explain that it was the way it was done..." (GD). Human rights, empathy with the victims, the need to reveal hidden memories and to develop a critical conscience were the main reasons for the proposals in which the problems of the present were not ignored; "...to make them want to know, to fight for a better world" (GA); paying special attention to the killing of the students in Iguala (GÑ); the war in Syria (Groups P, H, I, K) and to their own surroundings "...declarations made by the mayor: those killed by the Franco regime deserved it" (GG).

They encouraged activities outside of the classroom: the recuperation of memories, showing project work in the community, promoting civic actions: "writing a letter to the council to encourage participation and to leave the matter of keeping, or not, the monument to the Franco regime in the hands of the people" (GB); "They would prepare a story or a poem and read it in front of the monument commemorating the death of the victims" (GF).

The conclusions of the students were that what they had experienced was positive and that they wanted to transmit subject matter, method, emotion and commitment to their pupils:

...I want them to know about hidden realities...due to our personal experience of investigating...thinking critically...seeing the usefulness of history...We were taught to learn by heart and to have no feelings...through feelings the children would be able to put themselves in the shoes of the victims...and to understand that they have the power to stop it all from happening again...we are discovering more teaching resources all the time...making the most of our surroundings...even in the most unexpected places there are hidden stories,

such as the case of the people that escaped to the hills of O Rañadoiro or the Cova do Ladrón. (GG)

...to promote the remembrance of victims...as Marisa Peña's poem says:

"Mientras me quede voz hablaré de los muertos tan quietos, tan callados, tan molestos". (GP)

...to demand remembrance, not only as an act of justice, but also as a starting point...to demand a critical attitude as a means of social transformation. (GM)

...the book The Carpenter's Pencil says; "The injustice that gives rise to *social suffering* is basically the most terrible soul-destroying machine". We have learnt this thanks to doing this project. (G.L)

...it is all well and good to hold all these events in remembrance of the victims but it is not enough as younger generations are not aware of the history that lies behind the names on the signs. (GO)

Group GQ, which included students AC1 and AC2, were of the same opinion:

...basing themselves on their own surroundings...more knowledge from a different perspective to that of textbooks, paying attention to the role of victims, through their own investigation...acquiring a higher degree of social conscience and a critical way of thinking. (GQ)

The data obtained from the Final Reflection of the first phase reveals the acceptance of victims as being elements of heritage, which was predictable. However, it is the students' arguments that are of interest as they denounce the invisibility of suffering, blaming society in general and the process of the Transition:

...40 years of dictatorship were accepted as something normal, something which had to be eliminated as soon as possible (Final Reflection, Female Student-1 RFAM1)

..."stirring up something nobody wanted to" the words of politicians who lack sense but not votes...more than 2000 mass graves left untouched. (RFAH1)

If it were not about burying the past, they would treat the victims like those of jihadism. (RFAM2)

Furthermore, their criticism also focuses on the current education system and even on the erection of memorials which are then not treated in accordance with the claimed objective:

The way it is covered up is visible in the education system. (RFAH2)

...a utopia, given the way classes are taught nowadays. (RFAM3)  
...it is not only about holding commemorations or erecting monuments and plaques. (RFAM3)  
It is strange how some people claim to give importance to victims, erecting a statue...only to leave it abandoned and without use. (RFAM2).

Finally, the role which should be played by this new dimension of heritage in the primary education system was unanimously appreciated:

...wars should be interpreted from an early age...We should be able to pass in front of a plaque or a monument and stop to look. (RFAM4).  
...education without censorship, making the most of one's surroundings. (RFAM5)  
...as a future teacher I am sure that...an uncertain past only serves to open more wounds and that the act of remembering must be responsible for healing them. (RFAH1)

In this stage, the arguments of students AC1 and AC2 were similar:

...solidarity, altruistic actions and empathy are extremely important values... For this reason, it is necessary to work on aspects such as human rights in primary education in order for them to flourish from childhood, the time of life which the poet R. M. Rilke considered to be his homeland. (AC1)  
During our schooling and over the subsequent years, we did not receive a decent education in the history of humankind...Beginning with the recognition given by dignity, we can achieve an internationalist education... focusing on what was lost, not on who won in order to recognize who is always the victim. (AC2)

### **The data: from commitment to the primary classroom (the second phase)**

This phase consisted of attempting to prove the ability to apply the method and opening up heritage identification processes in any educational context. The trainee teacher AC1 based himself on contents programmed for the 4<sup>th</sup> year of primary education: the landscape. His pupils identified themselves with “natural” aspects as a symbol of a protected area:

What could we do to protect our surroundings?...they decided to create a patrol of vigilantes to protect the area around the school...a project began voluntarily...at break-times to collect litter and increase awareness...

surprisingly they were willing to miss break-times when it was their turn... they saw it as a way of learning and playing. [This was kept up after they had left the school]. (Observational diary / DOAC1).

In the fifth year (AC2), they studied Galician literature, specifically Rosalía de Castro and the poem *A xustiza pola man*, in which a mother avenges the starving to death of her children by killing their oppressor:

They did not understand until they identified their feelings... They worked on their emotions, applied to current contexts... establishing parallels with characters from the poem. In addition to condemning violence, the suffering of the past and the value of justice were understood by looking at the poem and its author from a different point of view. These were valid experiments to link up with International Women's Day... a joint initiative which we decided to celebrate with an event... which gave rise to reflection... asking why there is an International Women's Day and not one for men. One pupil answered "why the hell do we want a day for men if they already live like kings?"... they assimilated the idea of inequality and the reason for feminist vindication... the first time the day was celebrated was in 1936, we thought about the next time and what occurred in the time in between, which would help us for our future proposal. (Joint Final Report /RFC; DOAC1 and DOAC2).

The trainee teachers noted that the subject of memory on a local scale did not leave them indifferent. Before presenting the activity "my tutor and the head teacher asked about the topic... because it creates conflict. I attempted to downplay it so as not to alarm them." (DOAC2); "they asked about the proposal but never questioned it." (DOAC1).

As the specific work sessions were carried out, the trainee teachers showed their capacity for discovering and evaluating their pupils' degree of identification with heritage (recording of first session 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> years: GPS4<sup>o</sup> and GPS5<sup>o</sup>). On the whole, the pupils accepted the medieval tower due to its proximity, size and age. The 5<sup>th</sup> year pupils also accepted the statue of the deer as it represents nature and the place in which it is located. A girl in the 4<sup>th</sup> year associated the emblematic fountain with the photographs of her first communion, thereby stimulating the memory of other pupils. The monument to the victims did not stir their interest, however, as it was far away and lacking in attractiveness and sense. One exception, though, was a girl from the 4<sup>th</sup> year, who associated it with people who "died or were killed". The response of this child put to the

test the trainee teachers' ability to express critical opinions based on experience and considered in relation to the acquisition of social skills:

The case of this girl was damning. The other teachers considered her to be lazy and a liar, who only showed an interest in the arts. They ignored her sensibility to social issues, which she expressed through drawings which astonished her classmates...Her response made me see that discourses, not attitudes are praised (DOAC1).

At the same time, teaching strategies promoting reflection among the pupils were employed. In the first session (GPS4º; GPS5º) it was observed how, "thanks to the awareness created by commemorating International Women's Day" (DOAC2), they began finding out about the acts of barbarity, focusing on names (5<sup>th</sup> year) or on the date (1937) accompanying the names (4<sup>th</sup> year). This stimulated their interest in research, which increased in the following session (recording second session 1 / GSS14º y GSS15º), in which the images of the past gained meaning and aroused emotions. This was not without its difficulties, for example, in the case of the 4<sup>th</sup> year pupils studying the image of the agricultural trade union movement, they had to imagine that they had to protest for more break-times. In order to do this, they had to unite to become stronger. With differing degrees of emotional impact, all the photographs enabled them to gain an understanding of suffering. Indeed, one girl from the 5<sup>th</sup> year asked the trainee teacher if he could be the murdered teacher of the monument shown in the photograph. Both qualified the experience with the words "fear" and "sadness", though they "were not intimidated and wanted to know more", demonstrating a "rebellious attitude towards injustice" (DOAC1; DOAC2; RFC). This was particularly noticeable upon seeing the lines of Spanish exiles from 1939 and those of Syrians today or when comparing hippies and prisoners of the Franco regime. Although both images are in black and white, they thought that they were not from the same period, contrasting the "happiness" and "sadness" also associated to the monument.

Another relevant piece of information is that the trainee teachers managed to give meaning to the recuperation of memory by getting the children to share images of the past and emotions with their families (4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup> year notebooks / CC4º, CC5º, GSS24º and GSS2-5º). It could be observed that the majority of the children commented that the knowledge and emotions previously experienced had an effect on them and they

realized that their grandparents “were interested in memory” (DOAC1; DOAC2). This led, in both classes, to a common position regarding the victims. One girl from the 4<sup>th</sup> year repeated something her grandmother had told her: “my school was the field and my teacher was the hoe”. This phrase proved so popular that the decision was taken to write it on the blackboard where it remained for some time (DOAC1). The children’s interest was also aroused when it emerged that the same grandmother knew the sister of the murdered teacher.

The field trip session enabled the trainee teachers to assess how the activity had created interest outside of the school (recording third joint session (GTSC; DOAC1; DOAC2). Unexpectedly, on this trip people from outside the school participated by contributing their knowledge about the monument and the surrounding area: a secondary school teacher, the priest of the area in which the monument is located (who is in favour of recuperating memory), the mother of a 5<sup>th</sup> year pupil, who encouraged her child to take along an essay about what had happened.

As an epilogue to this activity, it must be mentioned that the trainee teachers were able to promote a critical spirit and the acquisition of social skills to enable their pupils to obtain their own perspective of heritage (recording final session: GUS4°; GUS5°). One pupil from the 5<sup>th</sup> year, with the agreement of his classmates, said, “I feel more connected with the tower because we can see it every day. The monument is very important but it is far away.” A similar attitude could be noted in the 4<sup>th</sup> year. In both years (GUS4° and GUS5°), although aware of the importance of the monument, the pupils were not fully able to identify themselves with it due to its distance and its appearance. However, they were able to identify with its meaning, that is to say, with those who suffered, and they proposed the erection of a more attractive monument closer to their school:

...in the 4th year, an impressive change was undergone in how they identified the monument as heritage and how it should be made more well-known. They all came to the conclusion that it was a better representation of the area than any of the other monuments.” (DOAC1)

It’s not a question of putting a stone and leaving it to be forgotten. Rather, it is about education...There are lessons which are learnt by working. Much can be learned from children, all you have to do is let them talk and listen to them. (DOAC2; RFC)

## **Results: planning the future, settling the score with the past**

Cuesta (2007) is of the opinion that for critical education in the teaching of history, counter-memory must be promoted. Applied to heritage education, the perspective of conflictive heritages taken as a way of settling scores with the past can be taken into account. This experiment, begun in the university classroom with trainee teachers, led to them making use of their own historical memory as students. In this way, all of the productions reflected the importance attributed to the method in order to acquire useful historical knowledge compared to sterile learning practices. In addition, a second score has been settled upon discovering the hidden memory of suffering in nearby areas and in documentary sources and the emotions aroused by this. The process of extermination, which began with the 1936 coup d'état, had a great impact on Galicia (Domínguez, 2008; Preston, 2011; Míguez, 2012). Many authors have highlighted the educational relevance of the issue (Valls, 2007; López, 2008; Lamikiz, 2011). However, these matters have not been sufficiently developed in the education system, in the training of future teachers or in the primary classroom.

Education based on memory has made it possible to reflect on processes of identification with heritage involving social or citizen awareness and teaching skills. The trainee teachers showed that, without knowledge and commitment, they would contribute towards maintaining sterile routines which, a priori, they would make the responsibility of the families or of the active teachers.

The data shows that they have assumed a learning model in which rational and emotional elements form a whole and that heritage, memory and critical history can make up basic individual and collective identities, enabling an aspiration to a fairer society, one which responds to Adorno's (1998) aspiration of making the idea of not repeating the barbarity of extermination the most important focus of education. This model is reflected in the proposals drawn up in groups in class, designed as an opportunity for ambitious educational challenges, in terms of both methods and contents, in which a social and ethical commitment is explicit. They discovered, in the landscapes and memories of their surroundings, that the invisibility of the past supposes the impossibility of questioning the present. At the same time, they broadened their horizons of what can be defined as heritage, creating the need to promote

processes of identification in order to question any identity which claims to present itself as the only one. As has been observed, the point has been reached at which the present can be questioned, along with the memory built up during the process of the Transition. By avoiding any conflictive reflection around assumable heritage, this process has allowed the symbology of the Franco regime to be treated in a sterile way under the protection of historical heritage whilst memories and places with the capacity to form new types of material and immaterial heritage remain hidden.

As far as the practical application of this methodology in the primary classroom is concerned, we have seen that a monument erected in remembrance of the victims has proved to be the way in which the heritage education model, discussed in the university classroom beforehand, has been applied. The two trainee teachers have proved to be able to apply the methodology in the primary classroom, by making use of the landscape, literature or a civic event which could have been banal had it not been for their ability to turn it into an opportunity for reflection and to give it meaning for a later activity. Both of them demonstrated that dealing with topics linked to historical memory in primary education does not lead to problems but rather connections, which would surely be impossible to achieve in issues in which emotions do not have such an important role to play.

Carrying out this activity has also allowed the value of group work to be emphasized, from investigating the surrounding area to sharing reflections on the experience. Furthermore, this skill is shown by the trainee teachers' ability to make their pupils interested in memory (through reflecting on local monuments) and to make them aware of what is around them, giving them access to it in order to reveal bad news about the past. Possibly one of the greatest achievements of the project has been not to impose the monument as just another study object but to encourage reflection upon it. This has made the results much more far-reaching to the extent that the pupils identify more with the victims as elements of immaterial heritage than with the monument itself, although they would have preferred to have a material memorial closer to their school or more in line with their tastes. This ability to awaken empathy with victims and reflection on their memory and all that this means shows that the trainee teachers managed to promote a form of education based on human rights, the acquisition of civic competence and social justice.

## Conclusions

Working with memory-based history and heritage education implies a high degree of emotional burden throughout the process, as is evident, or underlying, in the work produced by our students studying to be primary teachers and in the experiment carried out in the primary classroom. Therefore, it is extremely important that this does not drift towards the banality of tears without commitment. Rather, it should be a tool to learn how human suffering becomes a fundamental aspect in understanding society. From the point of view of an education committed to the present but focused on heritage, it is possible to dispute the dominance of the past with those who have always claimed control of it and that human rights and social justice should be more than mere words in syllabuses saturated with contents as a guarantee of inaction.

The proposed specific aims have been achieved to a reasonable degree. Therefore, we can also state that the main objective of the research has been fulfilled: trainee teachers who assume and understand a civic concept of heritage are able to transfer this perspective to primary school pupils. They have proved able to turn educational discourse into real practice with primary pupils who, in turn, acquired ethically informed knowledge regarding the material and immaterial heritage in their local area.

In our opinion, the results corroborate the validity of the educational model: from the university classroom to the primary classroom using the relationship between heritage education and historical memory in order to aid understanding of current problems. In this process, it is considered necessary to question the common concept of heritage and substitute it for one which is broader and more civic and related to a certain social and political context.

This study leads us to consider that the development of professional competence among teachers is related to the development of social skills. This makes it possible to identify visible and invisible heritage elements and to establish relationships between heritage and the recuperation of the memory of injustices and suffering, which can then be included in the practice of primary education teaching.

This is no easy task, which, in all probability, cannot be achieved with all trainee teachers. However, those who succeed in this aspect naturally assume the need to renounce automatically reproduced professional

routines to include a new dimension enabling them to discover a complex past containing hidden and forgotten injustices all around them. This understanding of heritage is not only made up of material remains but of the memories of people who lived and suffered in these places and should form part of an education system which is committed to the construction of a fairer society.

The professional competence of the two future teachers who carried out this project in the primary classroom is not only seen in the ethical aspect of their proposals, the choice of content and the design of the activities, but also in that they explicitly mention that they consider it necessary to relate research and educational innovation. For this reason, they have assumed the commitment to carry on with this experiment with the same pupils over the course of the next academic year, thus producing more data and more proof of the efficiency of this approach to education.

Finally, mention must be made of the limitations of this study, the most important of which is its lack of connection with similar processes of conflict between remembrance and obscurity which could lead to reflection about the victims and their educational and heritage dimension. Indeed, there are some examples which concern the western world, for example the case of the Vietnam War, which Loewen (1995) examined decades ago. This limitation also looks forward to future research, in which the issue of creating dialogue with educational proposals focused on this issue will be significant.

## Bibliography

- Adorno, T.W. (1998). *Educación para la emancipación*. Madrid: Morata.
- Benayas, J., & López, C. (2010). Propuesta didáctica para vivir el paisaje. *Iber. Didáctica de las ciencias sociales, geografía e historia*, 65, pp. 56-65.
- Busquet, J. (2010). La educación en paisaje: una oportunidad para la escuela. *Iber. Didáctica de las Ciencias Sociales, Geografía e Historia*, 65, pp. 7-16.
- Council of Europe (2000) *European Landscape Convention*: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/conventions/full-list/-/conventions/rms/0900001680080621>
- Creswell, J. (1998). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing*

- among five traditions*. London: Thousand Oaks.
- Cuesta, R. (2007). La enseñanza de la historia como contramemoria crítica. En S. Leoné y F. Mendiola (Coords.). *Voces e imágenes en la historia. Fuentes orales y visuales: investigación histórica y renovación pedagógica* pp. 151-184. Pamplona: Universidad Pública de Navarra.
- Cuesta, R. (2014). Genealogía y cambio conceptual: Educación, historia y memoria, *Archivos analíticos de políticas educativas*, Vol. 22.
- Cuesta, R. (2015). *La venganza de la memoria y las paradojas de la historia*. Salamanca: Llulo.com.
- Denzin, N., & Lincoln, Y. (2005). Introduction: The discipline and practice of qualitative research. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.). *The Sage handbook of qualitative research* (Third ed.). pp. 1-32. London: Thousand Oaks, Sage.
- Domínguez Almansa, A. (2008). De los relatos de terror al protagonismo de la memoria: el golpe de Estado de 1936 y la larga sombra de la represión. *Historia, Antropología y Fuentes Orales*, 40, pp. 37-74.
- Domínguez Almansa, A. & López Facal, R. (2014). Patrimonio, paisaje y educación: formación inicial del profesorado y educación cívica del alumnado de primaria. *Clio. History and History Teaching*, 40.
- Domínguez Almansa, A. & López Facal, R. (2015 a), Patrimonio, entorno y procesos de identificación en la educación primaria. *Clio. History and History Teaching*, 41.
- Domínguez Almansa, A. & López Facal, R. (2015 b). Paisajes invisibles, patrimonios en conflicto: experiencias en la formación del profesorado y la educación primaria. In A. M. Hernández, C. R. García, J. L. de la Montaña (Eds.) *Una enseñanza de las ciencias sociales para el futuro: Recursos para trabajar la invisibilidad de personas, lugares y temáticas*, pp. 713-720. Cáceres: Universidad de Extremadura-AUPDCS.
- Domínguez Almansa, A. & Santiago Arnoso, B. (2014). La respuesta está en el viento: reflexión para una nueva docencia de la Guerra Civil. In L. Fernández Prieto & A. Artiaga (Eds.). *Otras miradas sobre golpe, guerra y dictadura. Historia para un pasado incómodo*, pp. 300-322). Madrid: La Catarata.
- Erickson, F. (1989) Métodos cualitativos de investigación sobre la enseñanza. In: M. C. Wittrock (Comp.). *La investigación en la enseñanza*, II pp. 195-301. Barcelona: Paidós.

- Estepa, J., Domínguez, C. & Cuenca, J. M<sup>a</sup> (1998). La enseñanza de valores a través del patrimonio. In: *Los valores y la didáctica de las ciencias sociales*, pp. 327-336. Lleida: Univ. Lleida-AUPDCS.
- Flick, U. (2004). *Introducción a la investigación cualitativa*. Madrid: Paideia Galiza Morata.
- Fontal, O. (2004). La dimensión contemporánea de la cultura. Nuevos planteamientos para el patrimonio cultural y su educación. In R. Calaf & O. Fontal Merillas (Coords.). *Comunicación educativa del patrimonio: referentes, modelos y ejemplos* pp. 81-104. Gijón: Trea.
- Fontal, O. (2011). El patrimonio en el marco curricular español. *Patrimonio Cultural de España*, 5, pp. 21-41.
- García Llamas, J. L. (2003). *Métodos de investigación en educación*. Vol. II. *Investigación educativa*. Madrid: UNED.
- Johnston, M. (2006). The lamp and the mirror. Action Research and Self Studies in the Social Studies. In Barton, K. C. (Ed.). *Research Methods in Social Studies Education. Contemporary Issues and Perspectives. A volume in Research in Social Education*, pp. 57-83. Greenwich: Information Age Publishing.
- Lamikiz Jauregiondo, A. (2011). El lugar de la memoria en nuestras clases de historia, In: R. López Facal et al. (Eds.). *Pensar históricamente en tiempos de globalización*, (CD included), Compostela, USC.
- Loewen, J. W. (1995): *Lies my Teacher Told me. Everything your American History Textbook Got Wrong*. New York: Simon & Schuster.
- López Facal, R. (2008). Memoria, historia y educación. *Aula de Innovación Educativa*, 177, 6
- Míguez Macho, A. (2012). Práctica genocida en España: discursos, lógicas y memoria. *Historia Contemporánea*, 45, pp. 545-573.
- Prats, J. & Hernández, A. (1999). Educación por la valoración y conservación del patrimonio. In: *Por una ciudad comprometida con la educación*, pp. 108-124. Barcelona: Ayuntamiento de Barcelona.
- Prats, J. & Santacana, J. (2009a). La ciudad un espacio para aprender. *Aula de Innovación Educativa*, 182, pp. 47-51.
- Prats, J. & Santacana, J. (2009b). Ciudad, educación y valores patrimoniales: La ciudad educadora, un espacio para aprender a ser ciudadanos. *Iber. Didáctica de las Ciencias Sociales, Geografía e Historia*, 59, pp. 8-21.
- Prats, Ll. (1997). *Antropología y Patrimonio*. Barcelona: Ariel.

- Prats, Ll. (2005). Concepto y Gestión del Patrimonio local. *Cuadernos de Antropología Social*, 21, pp. 17-35.
- Preston, P. (2011). *El Holocausto español. Odio y exterminio en la Guerra Civil*. Barcelona: Debate.
- Rodríguez Gómez, G, Gil Flores, J. & García Jiménez, E. (1999). *Metodología de la investigación cualitativa*. Málaga: Aljibe.
- Sandín Esteban, M. P. (2003). *Investigación cualitativa en educación: Fundamentos y tradiciones*. Madrid: McGraw Hill.
- Stake, R.E. (1994) Case Study. In N. K. Denzin, & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.). *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, pp. 236-247. London: Sage.
- Taylor, S. J. & Bogdan, R. (1984). *Introducción a los métodos cualitativos de investigación*. Barcelona: Paidós.
- Valls, R. (2007). La Guerra Civil española y la dictadura franquista: las dificultades del tratamiento escolar de un tema potencialmente conflictivo. *Enseñanza de las ciencias sociales*, 6, pp. 61-73.

**Contact address:** Andrés Domínguez-Almansa. Universidad de Santiago de Compostela, Facultad de Formación del Profesorado; Departamento de Didácticas Aplicadas. Santiago de Compostela (A Coruña). E-mail: andres.dominguez@usc.es